

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE OPTICAL DISK DRIVE PRODUCTS  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

This document relates to:  
  
ALL ACTIONS

MDL CASE NO. 3:10-MD-02143 RS

**STIPULATION AND ~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER  
REGARDING ADMINISTRATIVE  
MOTIONS TO SEAL MATERIALS FILED  
IN CONNECTION WITH SUMMARY  
JUDGMENT AND DAUBERT MOTIONS**

DATE ACTION FILED: Oct. 27, 2009

1 WHEREAS, the Court has set a briefing schedule for the parties' dispositive motions  
2 ("Summary Judgment Motions"), and the parties' Daubert Motions (Dkt. 2211);

3 WHEREAS, consistent with this Court's previous direction to the parties in connection  
4 with administrative motions to seal (*see* Dkts. 1021, 1625), the parties wish to avoid burdening the  
5 Court with seriatim sealing motions, declarations, and proposed orders that are likely to be filed by  
6 the parties and various non-parties in connection with (1) Summary Judgment Motions, including  
7 any supporting declarations, exhibits, expert reports, and/or other evidentiary materials  
8 (collectively, "Supporting Materials"); (2) Opposition briefs to Summary Judgment Motions,  
9 including any Supporting Materials; (3) Reply briefs in support of Summary Judgment Motions,  
10 including any Supporting Materials; (4) Daubert Motions, including any Supporting Materials  
11 ("Daubert Motions"); (5) opposition briefs to Daubert Motions, including any Supporting  
12 Materials; and (6) reply briefs in support of Daubert Motions, including any Supporting Materials  
13 (collectively "The Motions");

14 WHEREAS, in order to provide sufficient time for the parties and non-parties to identify  
15 sealable materials in connection with The Motions, all parties other than the Indirect Purchaser  
16 Plaintiffs ("IPPs") have agreed to the procedure and schedule set forth below in Paragraphs 1-4,  
17 and the IPPs have agreed to the procedure and schedule set forth below in Paragraph 5(a)-(f) with  
18 respect to The Motions filed in the IPP action;

19 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, by and between the undersigned  
20 counsel for the parties, subject to Court approval, that:

21 Procedure With Respect to All Actions (Other than the IPP Action):

22 1. The party submitting materials in connection with The Motions (the "Filing Party")  
23 shall file under seal any document that contains or refers to information designated by a party (the  
24 "Designating Party") or non-party (the "Designating Non-Party") under any of the applicable  
25 protective orders entered in this action (Dkts. 923, 629, 1605).

26 2. Within three (3) business days after filing, the Filing Party must provide notice to  
27 any Designating Non-Party whose materials have been filed under seal pursuant to this Order.  
28

1           3.       Any Designating Party or Designating Non-Party that seeks to permanently seal  
2 information filed in connection with The Motions shall file an administrative motion to seal, a  
3 single declaration and proposed order in accordance with Local Civil Rule 79-5 no later than  
4 September 19, 2017, which is one week prior to the hearing on dispositive motions, addressing all  
5 of its sealing requests related to The Motions.

6           4.       Upon resolution of all such proposed orders, any Filing Party that believes revised  
7 redactions may be necessary for the public version of any document previously filed may re-file  
8 such document with the sealed portions revised consistent with this Court's rulings.

9           Procedure With Respect to the IPP Action:

10          5.       With respect to the briefing of The Motions to be filed in connection with the IPP  
11 action only (including initial motions, all oppositions, all replies, and all Supporting Materials), the  
12 following procedure and schedule will apply:

13               a.       When a Filing Party seeks to file a document that contains or refers to  
14 information designated under any of the applicable protective orders entered in this action (Dkts.  
15 923, 629, 1605), it shall file such document under seal and must include a Notice of Intention to  
16 Seal Documents (a "Notice").

17               b.       In the event the Filing Party intends to file material designated by a  
18 Designating Non-Party, the Filing Party must, within three (3) business days of filing a Notice,  
19 also provide the Designating Non-Party with the same materials it is required to provide to the  
20 parties to this action, with the exception that no material filed under seal by a Designating Party  
21 shall be disclosed to a Designating Non-Party.

22               c.       Within ten (10) business days of the filing of a Notice, any Designating  
23 Party and/or Designating Non-Party shall inform the Filing Party whether sealing of any material  
24 is required and provide proposed line-item redactions of materials and exhibits to the Filing Party.

25               d.       Within fourteen (14) business days of the filing of a Notice, the Filing Party  
26 shall file (i) a sealed courtesy copy of the filing that highlights or otherwise specifies any material  
27 requested to be sealed by a Designating Party or Designating Non-Party in accordance with Civil  
28 Local Rule 79-5(d)(2), and (ii) a public version encompassing the requested redactions.

1 e. Any Designating Party or Designating Non-Party that seeks to permanently  
2 seal information shall file an administrative motion to seal, a single declaration and proposed order  
3 in accordance with Local Civil Rule 79-5 no later than September 19, 2017, which is one week  
4 prior to the hearing on dispositive motions, addressing all of its sealing requests. The  
5 administrative motion to seal, declaration, and proposed order may be consolidated with the  
6 administrative motion to seal, declaration, and proposed order referenced in Paragraph 3 above.

7 f. Upon resolution of all such proposed orders, any Filing Party that believes  
8 revised redactions may be necessary for the public version of any document previously filed may  
9 re-file such document with the sealed portions revised consistent with this Court's rulings.

10 IT IS SO STIPULATED.

11  
12 Dated: June 22, 2017

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

13  
14 By: /s/ Belinda S Lee

Daniel M. Wall (Bar No. 102580)  
Belinda S Lee (Bar No. 199635)  
Brendan A. McShane (Bar No. 227501)  
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, California 94111-6538  
Telephone: (415) 391-0600  
Facsimile: (415) 395-8095  
Dan.Wall@lw.com  
Belinda.Lee@lw.com  
Brendan.McShane@lw.com

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20 *Acting as Liaison Counsel for Defendants*

21 Dated: June 22, 2017

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP

22  
23 By: /s/ Shana E. Scarlett  
SHANA E. SCARLETT

24  
25 Jeff D. Friedman (173886)  
715 Hearst Avenue, Suite 202  
Berkeley, CA 94710  
26 Telephone: (510) 725-3000  
27 Facsimile: (510) 725-3001  
jeff@hbsslw.com  
shanas@hbsslw.com  
28

1 Steve W. Berman (Pro Hac Vice)  
2 HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP  
3 1918 Eighth Avenue, Suite 3300  
4 Seattle, WA 98101  
5 Telephone: (206) 623-7292  
6 Facsimile: (206) 623-0594  
7 steve@hbsslaw.com

8 *Lead Counsel for Indirect Purchaser Class*

9 Dated: June 22, 2017

10 CROWELL & MORING LLP

11 By: /s/ Beatrice B. Nguyen

12 Beatrice B. Nguyen  
13 CROWELL & MORING LLP  
14 Three Embarcadero Center  
15 San Francisco, California 94111  
16 Telephone: 415.986.2800  
17 Facsimile: 415.986.2827  
18 bbnnguyen@crowell.com

19 Matthew J. McBurney  
20 CROWELL & MORING LLP  
21 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
22 Washington, D.C. 20004  
23 Telephone: 202.624.2500  
24 Facsimile: 202.628.5116  
25 mmcburney@crowell.com

26 *Attorneys for Plaintiff HP Inc. f/k/a Hewlett-  
27 Packard Company*

28 Dated: June 22, 2017

CROWELL & MORING LLP

By: /s/ Chahira Solh

Daniel A. Sasse  
Chahira Solh  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
3 Park Plaza, 20th Floor  
Irvine, CA 92614  
Telephone: 949.263.8400  
Facsimile: 949.263.8414  
dsasse@crowell.com  
csolh@crowell.com

*Attorneys for Ingram Micro Inc. and Synnex  
Corporation*

Dated: June 22, 2017

ALSTON & BIRD LLP

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

By: /s/ Rodney J. Ganske

Michael P. Kenny  
Debra D. Bernstein  
Rodney J. Ganske  
Andrew J. Tuck  
ALSTON & BIRD LLP  
1201 W. Peachtree Street NW  
Atlanta, Georgia 30309  
Telephone: (404) 881-7000  
Facsimile: (404) 881-7777  
mike.kenny@alston.com  
debra.bernstein@alston.com  
rod.ganske@alston.com  
andy.tuck@alston.com

James M. Wagstaffe  
KERR & WAGSTAFFE LLP  
101 Mission Street, 18th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105-1576  
Telephone: (415) 371-8500  
Facsimile: (415) 371-0500  
wagstaffe@kerrwagstaffe.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Dell Inc. and Dell Products  
L.P., and as liaison counsel for the Direct Action  
Plaintiffs*

Dated: June 22, 2017

CARLTON FIELDS JORDEN BURT, P.A.

By: /s/ David B. Esau

David B. Esau  
CityPlace Tower  
525 Okeechobee Blvd., Suite 1200  
West Palm Beach, FL 33401  
Telephone: (561) 659-7070  
Facsimile: (561) 659-7368  
desau@cfjblaw.com

*Attorney for Plaintiffs Acer America Corp.,  
Gateway, Inc., and Gateway U.S. Retail, Inc., f/k/a  
eMachines, Inc.*

Dated: June 22, 2017

KLEE, TUCHIN, BOGDANOFF & STERN LLP

By: /s/ Robert J. Pfister

David M. Stern (State Bar No. 67697)  
Michael L. Tuchin (State Bar No. 150375)

Robert J. Pfister (State Bar No. 241370)  
Jonathan M. Weiss (State Bar No. 281217)  
KLEE, TUCHIN, BOGDANOFF & STERN LLP  
1999 Avenue of the Stars, Thirty-Ninth Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90067  
Telephone: 310-407-4000  
Facsimile: 310-407-9090  
Email: [dstern@ktbslaw.com](mailto:dstern@ktbslaw.com)  
[mtuchin@ktbslaw.com](mailto:mtuchin@ktbslaw.com)  
[rpfister@ktbslaw.com](mailto:rpfister@ktbslaw.com)  
[jweiss@ktbslaw.com](mailto:jweiss@ktbslaw.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiffs Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee  
for the Circuit City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust  
and Peter Kravitz, as Trustee for the RSH  
Liquidating Trust*

Dated: June 22, 2017

ROPES & GRAY LLP

By: /s/ Mark S. Popofsky

Mark S. Popofsky  
One Metro Center  
700 12th Street NW, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005-3948  
Telephone: (202) 508-4600  
Facsimile: (202) 508-4650  
[mark.popofsky@ropesgray.com](mailto:mark.popofsky@ropesgray.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants Hitachi-LG Data Storage,  
Inc., Hitachi-LG Data Storage Korea, Inc.*

Dated: June 22, 2017

BLANK ROME LLP

By: /s/ Lisa M. Kaas

Lisa M. Kaas  
1825 Eye Street NW Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 420-2200  
Facsimile: (202) 420-2201  
[lkaas@blankrome.com](mailto:lkaas@blankrome.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants BenQ Corporation and  
BenQ America Corporation*

Dated: June 22, 2017

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By: /s/ Jeffrey L. Kessler

Jeffrey L. Kessler  
200 Park Avenue

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

New York, NY 10166  
Telephone: (212) 294-6700  
Facsimile: (212) 294-4700  
jkessler@winston.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Panasonic Corporation  
and Panasonic Corporation of North America*

Dated: June 22, 2017

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By: /s/ Robert B. Pringle

Robert B. Pringle  
101 California Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 591-1000  
Facsimile: (415) 591-1400  
rpringle@winston.com

*Attorneys for Defendant NEC Corporation*

Dated: June 22, 2017

BAKER BOTTS LLP

By: /s/ Evan J. Werbel

Evan J. Werbel  
1299 Pennsylvania Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 639-7700  
Facsimile: (202) 639-7890  
evan.werbel@bakerbotts.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Koninklijke Philips  
Electronics N.V., Lite-On IT Corp., Philips & Lite-  
On Digital Solutions Corp., Philips & Lite-On  
Digital Solutions USA, Inc.*

Dated: June 22, 2017

EIMER STAHL LLP

By: /s/ Nathan P. Eimer

Nathan P. Eimer  
224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100  
Chicago, IL 60604  
Telephone: (312) 660-7600  
Facsimile: (312) 692-1718  
neimer@eimerstahl.com

*Attorneys for Defendant LG Electronics, Inc.*



1 Dated: June 22, 2017

VINSON & ELKINS LLP

2 By: /s/ Craig P. Seebald

3 Craig P. Seebald  
4 2200 Pennsylvania Ave NW Suite 500 West  
5 Washington, DC 20037-1701  
6 Telephone: (202) 639-6585  
7 Facsimile: (202) 639-660  
8 cseebald@velaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Hitachi, Ltd.*

9 Dated: June 22, 2017

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

10 By: /s/ Ian T. Simmons

11 Ian T. Simmons  
12 1625 Eye Street, NW  
13 Washington, DC 20006  
14 Telephone: (202) 383-5300  
15 Facsimile: (202) 383-5414  
16 isimmons@omm.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Samsung Electronics Co.,  
Ltd. and Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*

17 Dated: June 22, 2017

JONES DAY

18 By: /s/ Eric P. Enson

19 Eric P. Enson  
20 555 South Flower Street  
21 Fiftieth Floor  
22 Los Angeles, CA 90071  
23 Telephone: (213) 489-3939  
24 Facsimile: (213) 243-2539  
25 epenson@JonesDay.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Pioneer North America,  
Inc. and Pioneer Electronics (USA) Inc.*

26 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

27 DATED: 6/28/17

28   
HONORABLE RICHARD SEEBORG  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE